EVALUATIONS

There are 5 evaluators

George Ivory

Thomas J. Calhoun

Machell Stockstill

Billy Scott

Carla Williams

There are three (3) responses

Proposal 1 – CBIZ

Proposal 2 – Gallagher

Proposal 3 -DrHub

RESET FORM

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Proposal Evaluation Sheet

Criteria	Weight	Proposal #1			Proposal #2			Proposal #3			Proposal #4			Proposal #5		
		Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent
License	10%	4	3	30%	1	10	100%	2	10	100%			0%			0%
Comparable Clients	10%	4	10	100%	1	10	100%	2	10	100%			0%			0%
Agency Experience with Similar Plans	15%	4	10	15%	1	13	20%	2	13	20%			0%			0%
Experience of Primary Contact	15%	4	10	15%	1	13	20%	2	13	20%			0%			0%
Volume with Requested Company	10%	4	10	100%	1	10	100%	2	5	50%			0%			0%
Example of Competitive Quotes	10%	4	10	100%	1	10	100%	2	5	50%			0%			0%
Requirements of Requested Markets	15%	4	13	20%	1	13	20%	2	13	20%			0%			0%
Broker's Commission	15%	4	13	20%	1	13	20%	2	13	20%			0%			0%
Total	100%	32	79	0%	8	92	0%	16	82	0%	0	0	0%	0	0	0%

2. Definitions

Criteria	Includes the following
Licensed	The broker must be appropriately licensed and/or have legal authority to render the proposed Services.
Comparable Clients	The broker must have provided student athlete insurance brokerage service to at least one client (individual or group) comparable to MVSU. Include number of years services provided and Client's Address
Agency Experience with similar Plan	Broker must have at least five (5) years of experience as an organization in brokering insurance for student athlete injury or accident with programs similar in size and/or complexity to MVSU. Provide details
Experience of Primary Contact	Provide the number of years of experience the primary contact has specific to placement of student athlete coverage. Provide the number of years the primary contact has with placement of coverage with each requested company.
Volume with requested Company	Provide the approximate volume in premium dollars related to student athlete injury policies that your firm or company has placed with each requested company since July 1, 2023.
Example of competitive Quotes	Provide an example of a successful quote you have achieved since July 1, 2023. For a large group. Identifying the client is optional.
Requirements of Requested Markets	The insurance carriers requested must have an A.M. Best rating of A VIII or better and must be legally authorized to write the requested coverage in the State of Mississippi.
Broker Commission	Provide the commission percentage that the broker will charge in exchange for the services being provided. If not, please provide/explain the commission structure.
Comments 1	
Comments 2	
Comments 3	

Students' Athlete Health Insurance

Evaluator's Signature: George Shoy Date: 4-29-25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: George Ivory	**Department:** Athletics	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Athletic Director	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 1	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 56	**Score:** 79

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License	✓				
Comparable Clients				✓	
Agency Experience with Similar Plans			✓		
Experience of Primary Contact			✓		
Volume with Requested Company			✓		
Example of Competitive Quotes			✓		
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission				✓	

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time		✓			
5. Payment Render Timeline		✓			

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
4	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
4	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
4	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
4	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
4	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
4	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
4	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
4	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
4	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
4	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
4	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
4	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

1

BROKER: CBIZ

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	0	
2. Comparable Client	10	8	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	7	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	10	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	8	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	8	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	8	
8. Broker Commission	15	9	
TOTAL SCORE		58	

EVALUATOR: George Ivory DATE: 4-29-25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: George Ivory	**Department:** Athletics	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Athletics Director	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 2	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 14	**Score:** 92

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients					✓
Agency Experience with Similar Plans				✓	
Experience of Primary Contact				✓	
Volume with Requested Company			✓		
Example of Competitive Quotes			✓		
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission				✓	

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	☐	☐	☐	✓
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	☐	☐	☐	✓

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
1	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
1	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
1	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
1	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
1	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
1	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
1	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
1	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
1	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
1	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
1	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
1	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
1	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
1	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: GALLAGHER

2

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	10	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	12	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	12	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	8	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	8	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	12	
8. Broker Commission	15	12	
	TOTAL SCORE	84	

EVALUATOR: George Shorty

DATE: 4-29-25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: George Ivory	**Department:** Athletics	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Athletics Director	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 3	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 28	**Score:** 82

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients					✓
Agency Experience with Similar Plans				✓	
Experience of Primary Contact				✓	
Volume with Requested Company		✓			
Example of Competitive Quotes		✓			
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission				✓	

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time				✓	
5. Payment Render Timeline				✓	

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
2	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
2	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
2	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
2	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
2	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
2	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
2	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
2	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
2	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
2	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
2	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
2	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

3

BROKER: DRHUB

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	10	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	12	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	12	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	7	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	7	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	10	
8. Broker Commission	15	10	
	TOTAL SCORE	78	

EVALUATOR: George Avery

DATE: 4-29-25

This page is blank on purpose.

There are 5 evaluators

George Ivory

Thomas J. Calhoun

Machell Stockstill

Billy Scott

Carla Williams

There are three (3) responses

Proposal 1 – CBIZ

Proposal 2 – Gallagher

Proposal 3 -DrHub

RESET FORM

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Proposal Evaluation Sheet

		Proposal #1			Proposal #2			Proposal #3			Proposal #4			Proposal #5		
Criteria	**Weight**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**
License	10%	4	3	30%	2	10	100%	3	10	100%			0%			0%
Comparable Clients	10%	4	5	50%	2	10	100%	3	10	100%			0%			0%
Agency Experience with Similar Plans	15%	4	10	15%	2	15	23%	3	10	15%			0%			0%
Experience of Primary Contact	15%	4	10	15%	2	15	23%	3	10	15%			0%			0%
Volume with Requested Company	10%	4	10	100%	2	10	100%	3	10	100%			0%			0%
Example of Competitive Quotes	10%	4	10	100%	2	10	100%	3	5	50%			0%			0%
Requirements of Requested Markets	15%	4	10	15%	2	13	20%	3	5	8%			0%			0%
Broker's Commission	15%	4	10	15%	2	13	20%	3	5	8%			0%			0%
Total	100%	32	68	0%	16	96	0%	24	65	0%	0	0	0%	0	0	0%

2. Definitions

Criteria	Includes the following
Licensed	The broker must be appropriately licensed and/or have legal authority to render the proposed Services.
Comparable Clients	The broker must have provided student athlete insurance brokerage service to at least one client (individual or group) comparable to MVSU. Include number of years services provided and Client's Address
Agency Experience with similar Plan	Broker must have at least five (5) years of experience as an organization in brokering insurance for student athlete injury or accident with programs similar in size and/or complexity to MVSU. Provide details
Experience of Primary Contact	Provide the number of years of experience the primary contact has specific to placement of student athlete coverage. Provide the number of years the primary contact has with placement of coverage with each requested company.
Volume with requested Company	Provide the approximate volume in premium dollars related to student athlete injury policies that your firm or company has placed with each requested company since July 1, 2023.
Example of competitive Quotes	Provide an example of a successful quote you have achieved since July 1, 2023. For a large group. Identifying the client is optional.
Requirements of Requested Markets	The insurance carriers requested must have an A.M. Best rating of A VIII or better and must be legally authorized to write the requested coverage in the State of Mississippi.
Broker Commission	Provide the commission percentage that the broker will charge in exchange for the services being provided. If not, please provide/explain the commission structure.
Comments 1	
Comments 2	
Comments 3	

Students' Athlete Health Insurance

Evaluator's Signature: [signature] Date: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Thomas J. Calhoun	**Department:** Student Affairs	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Director	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 1	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 56	**Score:** 68

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License	✓				
Comparable Clients	✓	✓			
Agency Experience with Similar Plans			✓		
Experience of Primary Contact			✓		
Volume with Requested Company					✓
Example of Competitive Quotes					✓
Requirements of Requested Markets			✓		
Broker's Commission			✓		

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	✓	☐	☐	☐
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	✓	☐	☐	☐

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) (using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions)*

Rating	Questions
4	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
4	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
4	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
4	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
4	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
4	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
4	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
4	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
4	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
4	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
4	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
4	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: CBIZ

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100 | Pts | SCORE | NOTES

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	0	
2. Comparable Client	10	7	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	10	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	8	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	8	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	9	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	8	
8. Broker Commission	15	8	
TOTAL SCORE		58	

EVALUATOR: T Calhoun DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Thomas J. Calhoun	**Department:** Student Affairs	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Director	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 2	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 28	**Score:** 96

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients					✓
Agency Experience with Similar Plans					✓
Experience of Primary Contact					✓
Volume with Requested Company					✓
Example of Competitive Quotes					✓
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission				✓	

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	☐	☐	✓	☐
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	☐	☐	✓	☐

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
2	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
2	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
2	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
2	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
2	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
2	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
2	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
2	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
2	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
2	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
2	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
2	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: GALLAGHER

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	8	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	15	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	15	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	10	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	8	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	12	
8. Broker Commission	15	12	
	TOTAL SCORE	90	

EVALUATOR: TCalhoun DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Thomas J. Calhoun	**Department:** Student Affairs	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Director	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 3	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 42	**Score:** 65

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients					✓
Agency Experience with Similar Plans			✓		
Experience of Primary Contact			✓		
Volume with Requested Company					✓
Example of Competitive Quotes		✓			
Requirements of Requested Markets		✓			
Broker's Commission		✓			

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time			✓		
5. Payment Render Timeline			✓		

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
3	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
3	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
3	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
3	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
3	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
3	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
3	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
3	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
3	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
3	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
3	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
3	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: DRHUB

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	8	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	10	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	10	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	8	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	6	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	7	
8. Broker Commission	15	7	
TOTAL SCORE		66	

EVALUATOR: TCalhoun DATE: 4/29/25

This page is blank on purpose.

There are 5 evaluators

George Ivory

Thomas J. Calhoun

Machell Stockstill

Billy Scott

Carla Williams

There are three (3) responses

Proposal 1 – CBIZ

Proposal 2 – Gallagher

Proposal 3 -DrHub

RESET FORM

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Proposal Evaluation Sheet

		Proposal #1			Proposal #2			Proposal #3			Proposal #4			Proposal #5		
Criteria	**Weight**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**	**Rating**	**Score**	**Percent**
License	10%	3	3	30%	1	10	100%	4	10	100%			0%			0%
Comparable Clients	10%	3	10	100%	1	10	100%	4	10	100%			0%			0%
Agency Experience with Similar Plans	15%	3	13	20%	1	10	15%	4	10	15%			0%			0%
Experience of Primary Contact	15%	3	15	23%	1	5	8%	4	10	15%			0%			0%
Volume with Requested Company	10%	3	3	30%	1	10	100%	4	5	50%			0%			0%
Example of Competitive Quotes	10%	3	3	30%	1	10	100%	4	5	50%			0%			0%
Requirements of Requested Markets	15%	3	15	23%	1	15	23%	4	5	8%			0%			0%
Broker's Commission	15%	3	5	8%	1	10	15%	4	5	8%			0%			0%
Total	100%	24	67	0%	8	80	0%	32	60	0%	0	0	0%	0	0	0%

2. Definitions

Criteria	Includes the following
Licensed	The broker must be appropriately licensed and/or have legal authority to render the proposed Services.
Comparable Clients	The broker must have provided student athlete insurance brokerage service to at least one client (individual or group) comparable to MVSU. Include number of years services provided and Client's Address
Agency Experience with similar Plan	Broker must have at least five (5) years of experience as an organization in brokering insurance for student athlete injury or accident with programs similar in size and/or complexity to MVSU. Provide details
Experience of Primary Contact	Provide the number of years of experience the primary contact has specific to placement of student athlete coverage. Provide the number of years the primary contact has with placement of coverage with each requested company.
Volume with requested Company	Provide the approximate volume in premium dollars related to student athlete injury policies that your firm or company has placed with each requested company since July 1, 2023.
Example of competitive Quotes	Provide an example of a successful quote you have achieved since July 1, 2023. For a large group. Identifying the client is optional.
Requirements of Requested Markets	The insurance carriers requested must have an A.M. Best rating of A VIII or better and must be legally authorized to write the requested coverage in the State of Mississippi.
Broker Commission	Provide the commission percentage that the broker will charge in exchange for the services being provided. If not, please provide/explain the commission structure.
Comments 1	
Comments 2	
Comments 3	

Students' Athlete Health Insurance

Evaluator's Signature: Machelle Stockstill Date: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Machelle Stockstill	**Department:** Business and Finance	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Senior Accountant/Bursar	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 1	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Health Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 42	**Score:** 67

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License	✓				
Comparable Clients			✓		
Agency Experience with Similar Plans				✓	
Experience of Primary Contact					✓
Volume with Requested Company	✓				
Example of Competitive Quotes	✓				
Requirements of Requested Markets					✓
Broker's Commission		✓			

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time			✓		
5. Payment Render Timeline			✓		

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
3	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
3	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
3	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
3	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
3	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
3	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
3	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
3	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
3	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
3	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
3	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
3	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: CBIZ

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	0	Licensed information was not provided.
2. Comparable Client	10	10	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	10	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	15	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	2	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	2	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	15	
8. Broker Commission	15	5	
	TOTAL SCORE	59	

EVALUATOR: Machelle Stuckstill DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Machelle Stockstill	**Department:** Business and Finance	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Senior Accountant/Bursar	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 2	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 14	**Score:** 80

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients		✓			
Agency Experience with Similar Plans				✓	
Experience of Primary Contact					✓
Volume with Requested Company		✓			
Example of Competitive Quotes					✓
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission			✓		

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	☐	☐	☐	✓
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	☐	☐	☐	✓

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
1	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
1	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
1	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
1	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
1	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
1	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
1	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
1	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
1	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
1	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
1	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
1	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
1	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
1	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: GALLAGHER

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	7	over 430 clients; however not listed
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	7	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	7	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	7	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	10	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	15	
8. Broker Commission	15	7	
TOTAL SCORE		70	

EVALUATOR: Machelle Stuckstill DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Machelle Stockstill	**Department:** Business and Finance	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Senior Accountant/Bursar	**Evaluator Qualification:**	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 3	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Ins.
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 56	**Score:** 60

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients				✓	
Agency Experience with Similar Plans			✓		
Experience of Primary Contact			✓		
Volume with Requested Company		✓			
Example of Competitive Quotes		✓			
Requirements of Requested Markets		✓			
Broker's Commission		✓			

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	✓	☐	☐	☐
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	✓	☐	☐	☐

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
4	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
4	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
4	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
4	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
4	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
4	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
4	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
4	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
4	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
4	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
4	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
4	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: DRHUB

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	8	Service over 250 clients, including HBCU
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	8	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	8	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	5	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	4	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	5	
8. Broker Commission	15	5	
	TOTAL SCORE	53	

EVALUATOR: Machelle Stockstill DATE: 4/29/25

This page is blank on purpose.

There are 5 evaluators

George Ivory

Thomas J. Calhoun

Machell Stockstill

Billy Scott

Carla Williams

There are three (3) responses

Proposal 1 – CBIZ

Proposal 2 – Gallagher

Proposal 3 -DrHub

RESET FORM

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Proposal Evaluation Sheet

		Proposal #1			Proposal #2			Proposal #3			Proposal #4			Proposal #5		
Criteria	Weight	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent
License	10%	4	3	30%	2	10	100%	3	10	100%			0%			0%
Comparable Clients	10%	4	10	100%	2	10	100%	3	8	80%			0%			0%
Agency Experience with Similar Plans	15%	4	12	18%	2	15	23%	3	12	18%			0%			0%
Experience of Primary Contact	15%	4	12	18%	2	15	23%	3	10	15%			0%			0%
Volume with Requested Company	10%	4	10	100%	2	10	100%	3	5	50%			0%			0%
Example of Competitive Quotes	10%	4	10	100%	2	10	100%	3	10	100%			0%			0%
Requirements of Requested Markets	15%	4	13	20%	2	14	21%	3	12	18%			0%			0%
Broker's Commission	15%	4	3	5%	2	0	0%	3	3	5%			0%			0%
Total	100%	32	73	0%	16	84	0%	24	70	0%	0	0	0%	0	0	0%

2. Definitions

Criteria	Includes the following
Licensed	The broker must be appropriately licensed and/or have legal authority to render the proposed Services.
Comparable Clients	The broker must have provided student athlete insurance brokerage service to at least one client (individual or group) comparable to MVSU. Include number of years services provided and Client's Address
Agency Experience with similar Plan	Broker must have at least five (5) years of experience as an organization in brokering insurance for student athlete injury or accident with programs similar in size and/or complexity to MVSU. Provide details
Experience of Primary Contact	Provide the number of years of experience the primary contact has specific to placement of student athlete coverage. Provide the number of years the primary contact has with placement of coverage with each requested company.
Volume with requested Company	Provide the approximate volume in premium dollars related to student athlete injury policies that your firm or company has placed with each requested company since July 1, 2023.
Example of competitive Quotes	Provide an example of a successful quote you have achieved since July 1, 2023. For a large group. Identifying the client is optional.
Requirements of Requested Markets	The insurance carriers requested must have an A.M. Best rating of A VIII or better and must be legally authorized to write the requested coverage in the State of Mississippi.
Broker Commission	Provide the commission percentage that the broker will charge in exchange for the services being provided. If not, please provide/explain the commission structure.
Comments 1	
Comments 2	
Comments 3	

Students' Athlete Health Insurance

Evaluator's Signature: [signature] Date: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Billy Scott	**Department:** Purchasing	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title:	**Evaluator Qualification:** CPPB, CMPA	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 1	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 56	**Score:** 84

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License	✓				
Comparable Clients					✓
Agency Experience with Similar Plans			✓		
Experience of Primary Contact			✓		
Volume with Requested Company					✓
Example of Competitive Quotes					✓
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission	✓				

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time		✓			
5. Payment Render Timeline		✓			

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
4	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
4	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
4	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
4	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
4	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
4	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
4	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
4	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
4	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
4	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
4	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
4	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
4	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: CBIZ

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	0	
2. Comparable Client	10	✓	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	12	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	12	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	✓	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	✓	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	✓	
8. Broker Commission	15	0	
TOTAL SCORE		69	

EVALUATOR: [signature]

DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Billy Scott	**Department:** Purchasing	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title:	**Evaluator Qualification:** CPPB, CMPA	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 2	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 28	**Score:** 106

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients					✓
Agency Experience with Similar Plans					✓
Experience of Primary Contact					✓
Volume with Requested Company					✓
Example of Competitive Quotes					✓
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission	✓				

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time			✓		
5. Payment Render Timeline			✓		

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) (using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions)*

Rating	Questions
2	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
2	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
2	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
2	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
2	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
2	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
2	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
2	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
2	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
2	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
2	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
2	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: GALLAGHER

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	✓	
2. Comparable Client	10	✓	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	✓	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	✓	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	✓	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	✓	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	14	
8. Broker Commission	15		
TOTAL SCORE		84	

EVALUATOR: [illegible] DATE: 7/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Billy Scott	**Department:** Purchasing	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title:	**Evaluator Qualification:** CPPB, CMPA	**How was evaluator selected:**
Proposal # 3	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Athlete Health Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 42	**Score:** 80

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✓
Comparable Clients				✓	
Agency Experience with Similar Plans				✓	
Experience of Primary Contact				✓	
Volume with Requested Company		✓			
Example of Competitive Quotes			✓		
Requirements of Requested Markets				✓	
Broker's Commission	✓				

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time			✓		
5. Payment Render Timeline			✓		

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
3	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
3	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
3	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
3	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
3	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
3	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
3	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
3	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
3	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
3	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
3	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
3	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: DRHUB

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	✓	
2. Comparable Client	10	8	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	12	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	10	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	5	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	✓	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	12	
8. Broker Commission	15		
TOTAL SCORE		67	

EVALUATOR: [signature] DATE: 4/29/25

This page is blank on purpose.

There are 5 evaluators

George Ivory

Thomas J. Calhoun

Machell Stockstill

Billy Scott

Carla Williams

There are three (3) responses

Proposal 1 – CBIZ

Proposal 2 – Gallagher

Proposal 3 -DrHub

RESET FORM

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE
UNIVERSITY

Proposal Evaluation Sheet

		Proposal #1			Proposal #2			Proposal #3			Proposal #4			Proposal #5		
Criteria	Weight	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent	Rating	Score	Percent
License	10%	3	3	30%	1	9	90%	2	10	100%			0%			0%
Comparable Clients	10%	3	10	100%	1	8	80%	2	9	90%			0%			0%
Agency Experience with Similar Plans	15%	3	11	17%	1	5	8%	2	10	15%			0%			0%
Experience of Primary Contact	15%	3	15	23%	1	5	8%	2	10	15%			0%			0%
Volume with Requested Company	10%	3	5	50%	1	10	100%	2	5	50%			0%			0%
Example of Competitive Quotes	10%	3	4	40%	1	10	100%	2	5	50%			0%			0%
Requirements of Requested Markets	15%	3	15	23%	1	13	20%	2	5	8%			0%			0%
Broker's Commission	15%	3	5	8%	1	10	15%	2	5	8%			0%			0%
Total	100%	24	68	0%	8	70	0%	16	59	0%	0	0	0%	0	0	0%

2. Definitions

Criteria	Includes the following
Licensed	The broker must be appropriately licensed and/or have legal authority to render the proposed Services.
Comparable Clients	The broker must have provided student athlete insurance brokerage service to at least one client (individual or group) comparable to MVSU. Include number of years services provided and Client's Address
Agency Experience with similar Plan	Broker must have at least five (5) years of experience as an organization in brokering insurance for student athlete injury or accident with programs similar in size and/or complexity to MVSU. Provide details
Experience of Primary Contact	Provide the number of years of experience the primary contact has specific to placement of student athlete coverage. Provide the number of years the primary contact has with placement of coverage with each requested company.
Volume with requested Company	Provide the approximate volume in premium dollars related to student athlete injury policies that your firm or company has placed with each requested company since July 1, 2023.
Example of competitive Quotes	Provide an example of a successful quote you have achieved since July 1, 2023. For a large group. Identifying the client is optional.
Requirements of Requested Markets	The insurance carriers requested must have an A.M. Best rating of A VIII or better and must be legally authorized to write the requested coverage in the State of Mississippi.
Broker Commission	Provide the commission percentage that the broker will charge in exchange for the services being provided. If not, please provide/explain the commission structure.
Comments 1	
Comments 2	
Comments 3	

Students' Athlete Health Insurance

Evaluator's Signature: Carla Williams Date: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Carla Williams	**Department:** Purchasing	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Purchasing Director	**Evaluator Qualification:** CMPD	**How was evaluator selected:** Position
Proposal # 1(A)	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Health Accident Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 42	**Score:** 68

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License	✔				
Comparable Clients					✔
Agency Experience with Similar Plans				✔	
Experience of Primary Contact					✔
Volume with Requested Company		✔			
Example of Competitive Quotes		✔			
Requirements of Requested Markets					✔
Broker's Commission		✔			

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	✔				
5. Payment Render Timeline			✔		

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
3	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
3	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
3	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
3	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
3	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
3	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
3	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
3	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
3	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
3	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
3	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
3	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
3	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY
STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION
FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: CBIZ

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	0	No license
2. Comparable Client	10	10	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	11	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	15	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	5	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	4	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	15	
8. Broker Commission	15	5	
TOTAL SCORE		65	

EVALUATOR: Carla Williams DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Carla Williams	**Department:** Purchasing	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Purchasing Director	**Evaluator Qualification:** CMPD	**How was evaluator selected:** Position
Proposal # 2(B)	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Health Accident Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 14	**Score:** 70

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License				✔	
Comparable Clients				✔	
Agency Experience with Similar Plans		✔			
Experience of Primary Contact		✔			
Volume with Requested Company					✔
Example of Competitive Quotes					✔
Requirements of Requested Markets				✔	
Broker's Commission			✔		

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	☐	☐	☐	✔
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	☐	☐	☐	✔

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
1	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
1	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
1	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
1	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
1	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
1	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
1	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
1	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
1	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
1	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
1	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
1	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
1	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
1	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: GALLAGHER

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	9	
2. Comparable Client	10	8	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	6	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	6	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	10	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	10	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	13	
8. Broker Commission	15	8	
TOTAL SCORE		70	

EVALUATOR: Carla Williams DATE: 4/29/25

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

Student Athlete Health Proposal Evaluation Form

1 . Evaluator *One form for each proposal*

Evaluator: Carla Williams	**Department:** Purchasing	**Date:** 4/29/25
Evaluator Title: Purchasing Director	**Evaluator Qualification:** CMPD	**How was evaluator selected:** Position
Proposal # 3(C)	**Proposal Date:** 4/25/25	**Name of Proposal:** Student Health Accident Insurance
Company Evaluation #	**Rating:** 28	**Score:** 59

2. Evaluation Questions *Place check mark in the appropriate box that represents your assessment*

Criteria	Fair	Good	Moderate	Very Good	Excellent
License					✔
Comparable Clients				✔	
Agency Experience with Similar Plans			✔		
Experience of Primary Contact		✔			
Volume with Requested Company		✔			
Example of Competitive Quotes		✔			
Requirements of Requested Markets	✔				
Broker's Commission	✔				

3. Overall Proposal Score/Rating procedures *(Rating with 5 being fair and 1 being excellent) [questions 4-6]*

Rating Per Criteria	5	4	3	2	1
Scoring Per Criteria	3	5	10	13	15
Both Rating and Scoring are to be used on Page 2					
4. Service Response Time	☐	✔	☐	☐	☐
5. Payment Render Timeline	☐	☐	✔	☐	☐

6. Effectiveness Key Metric *(Score 1-5) {using the above rating criteria place the number value to each questions}*

Rating	Questions
2	Was the proposal well organized? Did it follow the RFP Instruction?
2	Was the proposal easy to read? Were there clear win themes and action captions?
2	Was the company clearly able to satisfy the University needs?
2	Did the company address the RFP requirements and evaluations criteria?
2	Did the proposal clearly show how there proposal exceeds the others
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate resources and clientele?
2	Does the proposal show that the company has adequate years of services in this area?
2	Do the prices seem to be reasonable as it relates to other proposal?
2	Does this proposer seem to have a proven track record in this area?
2	Does this proposer have adequate Data storage to handle high demands in peak hours?
2	Does this proposal have adequate Personnel to handle circumstances that may arise?
2	In case of system failure does the proposal have contact numbers and personnel?
2	Does the proposal provide adequate solutions
2	Overall customer services

MISSISSIPPI VALLEY STATE UNIVERSITY

STUDENT ATHLETE ACCIDENT INSURANCE RFP EVALUATION

FY 2025 - 2026

BROKER: DRHUB

CRITERIA (Max Points) 100	Pts	SCORE	NOTES
1. Licensed	10	10	
2. Comparable Client	10	9	
3. Agency Experience with Similar Plan	15	8	
4. Experience of Primary Contact	15	7	
5. Volume with Requested Company	10	6	
6. Example of Competitive Quote	10	6	
7. Requirements of Requested Markets	15	6	
8. Broker Commission	15	5	
TOTAL SCORE		57	

EVALUATOR: Carla Williams

DATE: 4/29/25